

## State of New Jersey

OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL DEPARTMENT OF LAW AND PUBLIC SAFETY DIVISION OF LAW 25 MARKET STREET PO Box 112 TRENTON, NJ 08625-0112

GURBIR S. GREWAL Attorney General

MICHELLE L. MILLER Director

April 30, 2021

## Via Electronic Mail & JEDS System

Honorable Robert Lougy, J.S.C. Mercer County Civil Courthouse 175 South Broad Street, 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08650

> Re: <u>Persichilli v. Atilis Gym of Bellmawr</u> Docket No.: MER-C-48-20

> > Supplemental Letter in further Support of Plaintiff's Motion for Entry of Judgment

Dear Judge Lougy:

This office represents Plaintiff Judith M. Persichilli, R.N., B.S.N., M.A., in her official capacity as Commissioner of the New Jersey Department of Health, in this matter. Please accept this supplemental letter in further support of Plaintiff's Motion for entry of Judgment and in response to Defendant's untimely

opposition to same.

Plaintiff does not request any additional time to reply to Defendant's opposition, as Defendant's opposition is both grossly untimely and wholly without merit.



Philip D. Murphy Governor

SHEILA Y. OLIVER Lt. Governor

April 30, 2021 Page 2

Plaintiff's motion was filed and served on December 10, 2020, and the court initially sent a return date of January 8, 2021. On January 4, 2021, Plaintiff filed a brief reply, noting no opposition was filed. At Defendant's request, the motion was adjourned to April 1, 2021. At Defendant's subsequent request, the motion was again adjourned to April 30, 2021. The court sua sponte adjourned the motion to May 3, 2021.

On the afternoon of April 30, 2021, Defendant for the first time filed and served opposition to Plaintiff's motion. Initially, Defendant's opposition is grossly untimely. Pursuant to <u>Rule</u> 1:6-3, opposition was initially due by January 4, 2021. Even granting Defendant the widest latitude possible, opposition for the upcoming May 3, 2021 return date was due on April 26, 2021. <u>R.</u> 1:6-3(a); <u>R.</u> 1:3-1. Defendant's opposition is also fundamentally flawed substantively.

The sole contention in Defendant's opposition is to challenge the validity of the underlying gubernatorial Executive Orders and Departmental Administrative Orders which this court enforced. However, this issue has been repeatedly argued in this matter and repeatedly rejected by the court. As previously briefed and as this court found, "the validity of an agency order shall not be justiciable in an enforcement proceeding." <u>R.</u> 4:67-6(c)(3); see also In re Valley Rd. Sewerage Co., 295 N.J. Super. 278, 290

April 30, 2021 Page 3

(App. Div. 1996) (noting "the exclusive jurisdiction" of the Appellate Division to review the merits of state agency determinations pursuant to <u>R.</u> 2:2-3(a)(2)); <u>Bacon v. N.J. State</u> <u>Dep't of Educ.</u>, 443 N.J. Super. 24, 37 (App. Div. 2015) (trial court's powers in Rule 4:67-6 proceedings are "strictly limited to enforcement of an order"); <u>State Dep't of Envtl. Prot. v. Mazza & Sons, Inc.</u>, 406 N.J. Super. 13, 23 (App. Div. 2009) (the defendant in an enforcement action may not collaterally attack the merits of the administrative order before the trial court).

This issue has been well-settled in this case, and Defendant has neither sought interlocutory review nor reconsideration on that issue. Accordingly, Defendant's opposition is of no weight. Defendant articulates no legal justification for its brazen contempt of this court's orders, and Defendant offers no contradiction to the video and photographic evidence of open contumacious conduct.

For the reasons set forth in Plaintiff's December 10, 2020 motion papers, Plaitiff's January 4, 2021 reply, and above, the court should grant the Commissioner's motion, enforcing the court's October 8, 2020 Order and entering additional judgment against Defendant in the amount of \$139,479.84. MER-C-000048-20 04/30/2021 04:23:02 PM Pg 4 of 4 Trans ID: CHC202186447

April 30, 2021 Page 4

Thank you for Your Honor's ongoing time and attention to

this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

GURBIR S. GREWAL ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW JERSEY

By: <u>s/ Stephen Slocum</u> Stephen Slocum (907802012) Deputy Attorney General Stephen.slocum@law.njoag.gov

c. John McCann, Esq. Giancarlo Ghione, Esq.